There's No Free Lunch, Even Using Bitcoin: Tracking the Popularity and Profits of Virtual Currency Scams

Marie Vasek & Tyler Moore

SMU, Dallas, TX

Financial Cryptography January 26, 2015



Home FAQ Blog Investments Partners Contacts

WHAT IS LEANCY

With LEANCY, investing in startups and crowdfunding projects becomes easier and more rewarding than ever!

Our company specializes in IT industry investment management, including investing in startups as well as crowdfunding and fundraising projects.

LEANCY offers a unique opportunity to make money while helping innovative IT projects come alive!



LEANCY offers a flexible earnings percentage. To clarify, we guarantee you daily earnings equal to up to 5% of your investment. But is mean that you cannot make more than 5% daily with us. LEANCY has a system of percentages, which depend on the size of your investmet.

- x 1.00 from \$10 to \$1000. You get the standard percentage rate
- x 1.05 From \$1001 to \$5000. Your daily earnings percentage is the standard rate times 1.05. For instance, if the standard daily percentage you earn 4.5 x 1.05 = 4.725%
- x 1.15 from \$5,001 to \$15,000. Your daily earnings percentage is the standard rate times 1.15. For instance, if the daily percentage is earn 4.5 x 1.15 = 5.175%
- x 1.30 From \$15,000 to \$50,000. Your daily earnings percentage is the standard rate times 1.30. For instance, if the daily percentage earn 4.5 x 1.30 = 5.85%
- x 1.50 from \$50,001 and up. Your daily earnings percentage is the standard rate times 1.30. For instance, if the daily percentage is 4.5
 x 1.50 = 6.75%

At the end of each day, the earnings percentage is calculated and made available for viewing at your Earnings history

The major and most significant advantage LEANCY offers is instant earnings for the entire period of time that your investment portfolio re in other words, the amount available for withdrawal from our system grows not just very day but every hour, every minute, every second millisecond.



MAXIMIZE YOUR EARNING POTENTIAL WITH CRYPTORY!

CRYPTORY is a scalable system of distributed computing that allows you to earn a guaranteed stable yield on your investment. Our powerful computing system is optimized for mining **Bitcoins**, one of the most common decentralized currencies.



Learn about our service in this video





WELCOME TO THE BTC-ARBS!

Arbitrage is one of the most profitable forms of investment, however to the dismay of most investors, arbitrage opportunities are rare, especially in the efficient markets that characterize the global economic system. In 2009, that changed, with the introduction of Bitcoin. Unlike regular investment markets, the Bitcoin exchange market is inefficient, for a variety of reasons, thus creating near daily arbitrage opportunities. Bits-Arbs allows you to take advantage of these arbitrate opportunities, without the need for sophisticated software, large balances on numerous exchanges, or any of the other complicated tactics that are typically required to profit from arbitrage opportunities as they arise.



WHAT IS ARBITRAGE ?!

Arbitrage is the act of profiting from inefficiencies on any sort of exchange or economic situation. This is possible when the price of a particular commodity is one value in a particular marketplace. In a different value is another marketplace. In the context of Bitcoin arbitrage, the situation occurs when Bitcoins are being sold at one price on one exchange, and a completely different price on another exchange. This allows to purchase Bitcoins the exchange with the lower price, and re-sell those same coins on another exchange, and profit through the difference.ITo learn more about arbitrage, please visit our **How Arbitrage Works Date.**





Minimum Investment: \$50 or 0.05 Bitcoins ! Daily Returns: 0.1% to 10% ! Withdraw Principal At Anytime

The greatest limitation of a Bitcoin arbitrage system is the need for funds on multiple exchange

Groc Member

[HYIP] BTCROCKET - 3.5% Weekly Return, 182% Annual Return, 910% 5 Ye March 19, 2014, 06:28:52 AM

Hello investors:

Activity: 111



â 🌒

Ignore

This is the official BTCROCKET High-Yield-Investment Product thread.

Contract:

- Minimum investment: 0.02^B +u#
- No Maximum investment
- · Principal investment is not returned to investor
- · HYIP will pay 3.5% of your original investment weekly for a minimum of five years,
- · The HYIP will halt new investments five years before its termination.
- · The Bitcoin network transaction fees are not added to weekly interest payments les
- BTCROCKET reserves the right to raise the interest rate

To invest:

- First find out your u#. You can find this out by clicking on your username from one my u# is 5583: "https://bitcointalk.org/index.php?action=profile;u=5583"
- There are currently 8 decimal places in a Bitcoin transaction. For your investment, 1 0.02005583 B
- Send your investment to 14y5M45LrnjjmeMwjdFj4KvHaJBRkMya1x
- · PM me your investment amount and receiving Bitcoin address
- · Please allow 24 hrs for processing
- · Payments start 7 days after processing

May we all prosper.

Regards, Groc



1		
	R	r/bitcoin comments related view images (0)
l		
	5	Is the Onion Wallet a scam wallet? (self.Bitcoin) submitted 1 year ago by dmpice I
	▼ (2× 1)	I think someone I sent BTC to just had all of their BTC stolen. They were using the Onion Wallet confirmations after they received my BTC the money was transferred to another address, 1NRMGqPYXwPoAGHiPAMzBgkqCcmgms3hjH
ł		 Here is the website on Ter. http://ow24et2teta6tymk.onion^[1]
l		
l		 Here is the thread about the site on bitcointalk. https://bitcointalk.org/index.php?topic=23
		This is awful that new users are being scammed. I hope that this post can bring some awareness problem. Look at all the people possibly being scammed. It looks like someone new every day. https://blockchain.info/address/1NRMGqPYXwPoAGHiPAMzBgkqCcmgms3hjH ^[3]
		8 comments source hide all child comments
	all 8 comments - sorted by: best	subscribe
ł	navigate by: submitter	r moderator friend me admin highlighted gilded IAmA images videos popular new
ł	🔺 [-] losermcfa	il 🖙 11 points 1 year ago
	A hard less people that	on. Sorry for the persons loss. Hopefully the lesson was learned. I really have to wonder what it is could be so trusting.
	Trusting a t astonishing	cor-based onion wallet with the keys to the coins is like asking a junkie to keep your gold bars safe $_{\rm I}$ that anyone wouldnt realize this.
l	8 of 37 permalink	ource
ł		

→ C 🗎 https://	bitcointalk.org/index.php?topic=900132.1580		🔍 🖈 🏠 🤷
Bitcoin Foru	m	simple m	achines foru
		January 25, 2	015, 09:04:55 PM
Welcome, Guest, Ple	ease login or register.		
*	* Forever 🗘 Login		
Login with username, j	assword and session length		
News: ++ Users of I	Sitcoin Core on Linux must not upgrade to the latest OpenSSL. More info.	P	Sean
HOME HELP SEAR	DH DONATE LOGIN REGISTER		
iges: 1 30 31 32 3 3 74 75 76 77 78 79	3 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 [80] 81 82 83 84 85 86 87	62 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 70 71 72	
3 74 75 76 77 78 79	80 81 82 83 84 85 86 87		
Author	Topic: CRYPTODOUBLE.COM - 100% PROFIT IN JUST 100 HOURS - 5% REFERRAL C	OMMISSION (Read 57505 times)	
crazyearner Legendary	5% REFERRAL COMMISSION	-	
00000	Website down. Coins gone made some small profits. Game over here nothing	to see here any more move on fi	nd something n
Activity: 840	to ponzi about with.		
B			
Something Is Coming	Can		
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	Can		
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	Can		
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	Con BIT-X.com ►► New Real-time Cryp	tocurrency Exchange ৰ	
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	BIT-X.com >> New Real-time Cryp	tocurrency Exchange ◀ ◀	CREA
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	BIT-X.com >> New Real-time Cryp TtuneJack.com UBCC UBLOR CHILD Welcome Bonus UBCC UBLOR CHILD Welcome Bonus UBLOR CHILD WEICHILD WEICHILL WEICHILD WEICHILL WEICHILL WEICHILL WEICHILL WEICHILL WEICHILL WEICHILL WEICHI	tocurrency Exchange tive Roulette	CREA
Something Is Coming You Guess What? Ignore No.1	Con BIT-X.com >> New Real-time Crypt Conine Cryptocurrency Casino Conine C	tocurrency Exchange	CREA
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	Con BIT-X.com	tocurrency Exchange	CREA
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	Con	tocurrency Exchange Live soulette Live Sic Bo Provabilit Development Provability Provabil	CREA Fair
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	Con BIT-X.com b New Real-time Cryp ortune Jack.com usrc bit arc bit ar	tocurrency Exchange ◀ Live Roulette Proyably Live sic Bo alin yor juridcon. Advertse here. 5% REFERRAL COMMISSION	CREA Fair
Something Is Coming You Guess What?	BIT-X.com by New Real-time Cryp by to 1 Day by the stand stan	tocurrency Exchange Live Roulette Live Sic Box all in your jurisdicton. Advertise here. 5% REFERRAL COMMISSION mmers? Maybe We should "rent" some meters? Haybe We should "rent" some	Fair

Roadmap

- Motivation
- Methodology
- Overview
- Scams by category
 - Ponzi schemes (aka high-yield investment programs (HYIPs))
 - Mining scams
 - Scam exchanges
 - Scam wallets
- Scam Comparison and Discussion
- Conclusion

Methodology

- Define scam:
 - $\circ~$ Fraudulent by design
- Find potential scams
- Refine list down to scams as per our working definition.
- Find useable Bitcoin addresses for scams
- Measure money in/out of relevant addresses

Find Potential Scams



Find Potential Scams

5				
Author	Topic: List of Major Bitcoin Heists, Thefts, Hacks, Scams, and Losses (Read 19122 times)			
dree12 Legendary	List of Major Bitcoin Heists, Thefts, Hacks, Scams, and Losses April 19, 2014, 01:56:22 AM			
	Last updated: November 16, 2014, 12:36:50 AM. (However, some entries remain on the backlog.)			
Activity: 1218	List of Bitcoin Hoists			
Obitcoin	Following is the result of research on prior Bitcoin-related thefts. The list strives to be as accurate and informative where nessible I have provided references for assertions made within. For disputed thefts, I have applied best judged and the strive applied best judged best judged by the strive applied b			
2	included the ones that were most publicly accepted.			
Ignore	Because of the volatile nature of Bitcoin's exchange price, I have denominated heist estimates in B . Although not I major permanent bitcoin-denominated losses are also included in this list. If I missed any major thefts, heists, or I have any other information to contribute to one of these events, please leave a reply in this thread.			
	Note that this thread is relatively new and was created because of space limitations in the original thread.			
	Additionally, I would be grateful if contributors write commentary for each theft. Ideally, the theft descriptions sho detailed as possible. Much of the present commentary is inadequate.			
	Table of Contents			
	Table of Contents			
	License Eactual inaccuracies			
	Donation			
f 27	Scope			

Refining Scam List

	3004 34th Street, Lubbock, TX (806) 795-1148 Mon to Fri: 11am - 8pm Sat: 12pm - 8pm	UNCLE CHIEN'S CHINESE & THAI RESTAURANT	Dine In / Carry
	ANNOUNCEMENT	peanut sauce \$1.50. Daily Special: Asian BBQ pork, rice, veggle roll& Dri	nk \$7.50.
14 of 37			

Refining Scam List

SCAM] Leancy Ltd	- Bitco ×					
← → C	talk.org/index.php?topic=448250					≪ ☆☆ (
Apps For quick access, place y	our bookmarks here on the bookmarks bar. Import bookmarks now					
Differentian Francisco					~	
Bitcoin Forum						simple machines to
						January 23, 2015, 06:34:56 P
Welcome, Guest. Please log * Fi Login with username, password	in or register. orever C Login and session length					
News: ++ Users of Bitcoin C	ore on Linux must not upgrade to the latest OpenSSL. More info.				٩	S
HOME HELP SEARCH DONA	NTE LOGON REGISTER					
Bitcoin Forum > Economy >	Marketolace > Gambling > Games and rounds > [SCAM] Leancy Ltd	- Bitcoin Investment	- 150% Return & 59	6 Daily Interest		
,						« previous topic next
Pages: [1] 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26					
Author	Topic: [SCAM] Leancy Ltd - Bitcoin Investment - 150% Return & 5%	Daily Interest (Read 243	10 times)			
LeancyBTC (SCAM) Leancy Ltd - Bitcoin Investment - 150% Return & 5% Daily Interest Tebruary 04, 2014, 07:28:40 AM						
Activity: 70	LEANCY HAS NOT BEEN PAYING SINCE 03/11/14. NO ADMINS COULD BE REACHED.					
&						
Ignore						
	FortuneJack.com	Up to 1 Day Binary Trading	Live Roulette Live Sic Bo	Provably Fair Games	Start WINNING Now	
	Advertised sites are not endorsed by the Bitcoin	Forum. They may be unsafe, ur	trustworthy, or illegal in you	r Jurisdiction. Advertise he	are.	
LeancyBTC Member	LeancyBTC Member 00 01 02 02 02 03 03 04 04 04 04 05 04 05 04 05 04 05 05 05 05 05 05 05 05 05 05					
Activity: 70	PORTALS Activity: 70 Pacebook Group (Learny Investors) - A place (free of spam) for honest discussions regarding Learcy and other HYIPs and it's lifegal operations as well as news and updates regarding any information on those behin scame.					
&	Skype Room - Unfortunately, bitcointalk isn't displaying the link properly same intent as the FB group above.	so if you want to join, you'll	have to add the Skype use	r: leancybtc and include	e in the request message you're fr	om btctalk. This chat room has
Ignore						
15MHYER	∧ Re: Leancy Ltd - Invest w/ Bitcoins 150% Yields					
Member						

Refining Scam List



Scams – Summary Statistics

- 349 potential scams
- 192 fit our scam definition
- 39 had findable, useable addresses
- Categorized scams in 4 categories:
 - Ponzi Schemes (HYIPs)
 - Mining Scams
 - Exchange Scams
 - Wallet Scams

Scams – What Can Be Observed

	Victim Pay in	Victim Payout	Scammer Payout
HYIPs	\checkmark	\checkmark	derived
Mining scams	\checkmark	derived	derived
Scam wallets			\checkmark
Exchange scams			\checkmark



Home FAQ Blog Investments Partners Contacts

WHAT IS LEANCY

With LEANCY, investing in startups and crowdfunding projects becomes easier and more rewarding than ever!

Our company specializes in IT industry investment management, including investing in startups as well as crowdfunding and fundraising projects.

LEANCY offers a unique opportunity to make money while helping innovative IT projects come alive!



Three Types of Ponzis

- 1. Traditional HYIP (see Moore, Han, and Clayton FC '12)
- 2. Bridge HYIP
- 3. Bitcoin-only HYIP

HYIPs – Summary Statistics

	Bridge HYIPs	Bitcoin-only HYIPs
# Scams	9	23
Median lifetime (days)	125	37
Victim pay in		
# address groups (total)	9410	3 4 4 2
# address groups (median)	298	157
Amount paid (total)	\$6 456 593	\$842 909
Payout to victim		
Amount paid (total)	\$3 464 476	\$802 655
Payout to scammer		
Amount paid (total)	\$2992117	\$40 254

Daily payments into and out of Bridge HYIPs





We are hiring! If you are skilled in IC design / HDL optimization, shoot us your CV at info@labcoin.com

Note: All images displayed may be subject to significant changes.

Proprietary Bitcoin mining ASIC technolo



Launch est. Aug./Sept. 2013 - Learn

Mining Scams

Name	Source	Income (BTC)	Income (USD)
Labcoin	Blockchain	241	48 562
AMC	BitFunder	18041	1 327 590
Ice Drill	BitFunder	14 426	1558008
Asic Mining	Blockchain	12.6	5 532
Dragon Miner	Blockchain	1.63	1019

CoinOpend

[BTC]

Priie [BC]

MARKETS	PRICE	CHANGE
BC / BTC	0.00023488	0%
ADN / BTC	0.00001320	-5.71%
888 / BTC	0.00000286	23.81%
CAI / BTC	0.00034628	0%
NOTE / BTC	0.00000148	-29.52%
FAC / BTC	0.00000448	-3.24%
FCK / LTC	0.00000002	100%
FLAP / LTC	0.00000018	-5.26%
GIVE / BTC	0.00000191	-19.41%
GRS / BTC	0.00000318	-13.35%
ISR / BTC	0.00012640	-84.07%
LGC / BTC	0.00004238	-0.54%
LIM / BTC	0.00002012	-12.29%
MUN / BTC	0	0%
MYR / BTC	0.00000557	-8.99%
NLG / BTC	0.00000506	23.41%
PTC / BTC	0.00002163	35.1%
RT2 / BTC	0.00231568	-4.27%
TWE / BTC	0.00001256	-0.95%
ZET / BTC	0.00003779	0.35%
LTC / BTC	0.01634128	-8.91%
AC / BTC	0.00000577	-6.79%
COMM / BTC	0.00000054	-15.63%
HIRO / BTC	0.00000704	-1.4%
NOBL / BTC	0.00000035	-10.26%
WC / BTC	0.00000850	-6.59%
FLT / BTC	0.00000832	5.18%



Exchange Scams

Scam	Lifetime		Payout to scammer		
	Days	Alive?	BTC	USD	
BTC Promo	98	yes	44	\$22112	
btcQuick		no	929	\$73218	
CoinOpend	29	no	575	\$264 466	
Ubitex	91	no	30	\$96	



- 1. Victim deposits bitcoin into scam wallet.
- 2. If the amount of money falls below the threshold, the money stays.
- 3. If the amount of money is above the threshold, the scammer moves the money into her own wallet.

Wallet Revenue (BTC)



Wallet Revenue (USD)



2014

Revisiting Scam Categories

Scam category	Scam \$\$		Hook
Bridge HYIPs	\$6.5M	(in/out)	Greed
BTC-only HYIPs	\$840K	(in)	Risk appetite, greed
Mining scams	\$2.9M	(in/out)	Advanced-fee fraud
Wallet scams	\$360K	(out)	Information asymmetry
Exchange scams	\$455K	(out)	Information asymmetry

HYIP Inequality



Lorenz Curve of Payment Inequality for Bitcoin-only HYIPs

Scam Inequality



Scam Inequality



Policy Options

Why do scams matter?

- There are many victims
- Substantial amounts of money is being lost
- Scams undermine trust in the ecosystem

What should we do?

- The scams are clearly illegal
- The choice is whether to invest more resources in enforcement

Conclusion

- We studied four types of scams: Ponzi schemes, mining scams, scam wallets and fraudulent exchanges.
- Block chain enables us to quantify the lower bound of harm
- \$11 million from at least 13 000 victims over 42 scams
- Indirect harm undermines trust

Questions?

